SITE NAME: Shops
STREET ADDRESS: 173-175 Bourke Street Melbourne
PROPERTY ID: 101126

SURVEY DATE: October 2017
SURVEY BY: Context

HERITAGE INVENTORY: H7822-1657
EXISTING HERITAGE OVERLAY: No
PLACE TYPE: Individual Heritage Place
PROPOSED CATEGORY: Significant
FORMER GRADE: C

DESIGNER / ARCHITECT / ARTIST: Albert Purchas (1857), Godfrey & Spowers (addition)
BUILDER: N W Dike

DEVELOPMENT PERIOD: Victorian Period (1851-1901)
DATE OF CREATION / MAJOR CONSTRUCTION: 1857, 1920
THEMES

ABORIGINAL THEMES

Research undertaken in preparing this citation did not indicate any associations with Aboriginal people or organisations. Aboriginal Themes (Hoddle Grid Heritage Review, Stage 2 Volume 3 Aboriginal Heritage, March 2019) have therefore not been identified here.

HISTORIC THEMES

5 Building a Commercial City

DOMINANT SUB-THEMES

5.4 Developing a retail centre

LAND USE

HISTORIC LAND USE

Archaeological block no: 39
Inventory no: 657

Character of Occupation: Commercial, Residential

Land sale details not provided.

1839 Williamson
1840 Hoddle
1850 Proeschel
1855 Kearney
1866 Cox
1880 Panorama
1888 Mahlstedt

Three and two-storey buildings, Singer Sewing Machines.

1905/6 Mahlstedt

Three and two-storey buildings, R White, Bootshop; W G Higginbotham, Hairdresser & Tobacconist

THEMATIC MAPPING AND LAND USE

1890s Retail
1920s Retail
1960s Retail

RECOMMENDATIONS

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Melbourne Planning Scheme as an Individual Heritage Place.

Extent of overlay: Refer to map

SUMMARY

A complex of buildings comprising a three-storey Victorian building on the corner of Bourke and Russell Streets, and a three-storey Victorian building and a pair of two-storey interwar shops facing Russell Street.
HISTORICAL CONTEXT

Building a commercial city

Developing a retail centre

Even before the early 1850s, Melbourne had established the foundational infrastructure for international trade and commerce, including retail markets, shipping agents, and industry and finance houses - the beginnings of an entrepreneurial global city (Context 2012:2).

Retailing in Melbourne gained official recognition when eight market commissioners were elected in 1841 from a roll of local voters. The commissioners established the Western Market, which became the principal place for selling fresh food, with many goods transported from Melbourne to pastoral settlements. At this time Melbourne's population was 4479, and Australia's was 20,416 (Young and Spearritt 2008). The growth of retailing was accompanied by the construction of warehouses to store goods.

By the early 1840s, Elizabeth and Swanston streets, from the Town Hall in the east to the General Post Office in the west, had become the focus of retail activity, influenced also by the location of the Western Market in the west of the city. The Eastern Market opened in 1847 as a fruit and vegetable market on the corner of Stephen Street (later Exhibition Street) and Bourke Street and drew retail further east. The department store Buckley and Nunn opened in 1854, establishing Bourke Street as the preferred retail strip.

With the economic boom of the 1880s, the 1880s to the 1890s was a decade of significant expansion in Melbourne. Investment funds poured in from Britain, imposing buildings were constructed, and speculation reached fever pitch in land, houses, offices and shops (Marsden 2000:28). As Graeme Davison states, commercial Melbourne extravagantly asserted 'her wealth in stucco and stone' (cited in Marsden 2000:28). Multi-storey shop and dwelling type buildings housing ground-level shop with rooms above were constructed across the retail strips of Melbourne, and three- or more storied commercial and retail buildings began to proliferate between Bourke and Lonsdale streets from the late 1880s (Lovell Chen 2017:220).

Development slowed during the economic depression of the 1890s, only recovering with the revival of immigration in the first decades of the twentieth century. Although affected by World War One in the period 1914-1918, by the end of the 1920s Melbourne's population had reached one million. In the first decades of the twentieth century, some of the last residents moved out of the city to the new suburbs, with the retail sectors rapidly taking up city properties (Marsden 2000:29-30).

Development in the city slowed with the widespread economic depression of the later 1920s and early 1930s. Because of a lack of finance over this period, instead of new construction, some city buildings were substantially remodelled to create new commercial spaces.

SITE HISTORY

The corner allotment at 173-175 Bourke Street, part of Crown Allotment 18, Block 10, was purchased by Anthony Hordern Senior at the fourth Crown land sales in 1839. The block in Section 10 was bounded by Bourke, Russell and Little Collins streets, and the west boundary of Allotment 17 (CoMMMaps).
Located on the corner of Bourke and Russell streets, the subject property comprises two parts; an older three-storey corner building and a two-storey addition along Russell Street. The corner shop currently at 173-175 Bourke Street (originally 140 Bourke Street East) is also known as 144-146 Russell Street. The ground floor shops in the adjoining two-storey parts are numbered 138-140 Russell Street, and the upper storey premises are accessed from a doorway in Russell Street and are numbered 142 Russell Street (S&Mc 1942; CoMMaps).

Completed in 1857, the three-storey corner building was originally a flat-parapeted, palazzo style commercial building with a rendered finish and elaborate detailing. It was designed by the prominent English-born architect Albert Purchas who invited tenders for erecting ‘a large shop in Bourke Street for A Hordern’, noting the building location as ‘Bourke and Russell streets’ (Australian Builders 14 August 1856; Argus 13 August 1856:7, as cited in AAI record nos 39704 & 39703).

Although subdivided into a number of parcels, much of the land in Crown allotments 18 and 19 continued to be owned by the Horderns’ until Anthony Hordern Senior’s death in 1869.

The Hordern family is an Australian retailing dynasty who first came to prominence in Sydney (as merchants and retailers) with the establishment of Anthony Hordern & Sons, and then gained notability in rural pursuits, stockbreeding, stockbroking, fashion, cricket and parliament. Anthony Hordern Senior (1788-1869) and his wife, Ann Woodhead (c1791-1871) migrated to Sydney in 1823 with their four children. They moved to Melbourne in 1839, with their eldest son Anthony Junior and his brother, Lebbeus, returning to Sydney shortly after and setting up the drapery business, L and A Hordern in 1844. Hordern Senior eventually established the firm Anthony Hordern & Sons with his second son, Samuel, which became the largest department store in Sydney. With 52 acres (21 hectares) of retail space, Anthony Hordern’s Sydney store was once the largest department store in the world (Teale 1972).

The first tenant at 173-175 Bourke Street was the London & Melbourne Mantle Company, managed by C Henry & Co, which specialised in seasonal and occasional mantles and other ladies’ and children’s ready-made clothing and accessories. The building was leased mainly for use as their show rooms (Figure 1) (Age 1 July 1857:8; 7 November 1857:8).

The next tenant was Stanford & Co, importers of Singer sewing machines, who moved into the subject property in the early 1860s. At this time, the street-level verandah was added to the building (Figure 2) (Calvert 1863, ‘Stanford & Co’s warehouses’, SLV).
In September 1872, 173-175 Bourke Street was advertised for sale, together with other freehold sites owned by the late Anthony Hordern (Age 16 September 1872:4). At this time, the property was described as a:

valuable shop, three-stories high, and premises at the corner of Bourke Street and Russell Street, occupied by Mr Stanford, erected at great cost, and presenting an imposing appearance, unsurpassed by any place of business of this class in the city (Age 16 September 1872:4).

In the 1880s, Stanford & Co moved from the main ground-level shop facing Bourke Street but continued trading in the upper-storey premises through to the mid-1920s (S&Mc 1892 & 1920-1925).

From the mid-1890s to the 1970s, the shop at 173-175 Bourke Street was occupied by a chain store, Richard White’s Shoe Store, which had 52 outlets across Victoria (Figure 4) (Age 12 December 1936:9; 26 January 1957:5). The upper levels housed offices and club rooms during this time (Age 16 March 1957:35). From the 1980s until today, the Bourke Street shop has been tenanted by Florsheim Shoes Pty Ltd, another franchise shoe store that started in Chicago in 1892.
As mentioned above, the subject site also comprises the two and three-storey extensions at 138-142 Russell Street (Figure 3). The Russell Street additions were built in a number of stages. Also owned by the Hordern family, the land at 138-142 Russell Street (formerly numbered 96) had been integrated with the corner building by the 1880s, during Stanford & Co’s occupancy of 173-175 Bourke Street. Completed between 1880 and 1888, the narrow three-storey addition at 142 Russell Street replaced the two-storey building seen in (Figure 2) (Mahlstedt Map, section 1, no 10, 1888).

The current two-storey shops at 138-140 Russell Street (Figure 3) were built to a design by architects Godfrey & Spowers in 1920-1921, replacing the former nineteenth century shop and storage (Mahlstedt Map, section 1, no 5, 1910 & 1925; S&Mc 1910-1915).

Records show that the section that houses the lobby and a staircase to the upper levels (currently numbered 142 Russell Street (Figure 3) was erected between the late 1880s and 1895 (Mahlstedt Section 1, no 10, 1888; MMBW Detailed Plan no 1013, 1895). This addition, however, appears to have been replaced above ground floor level with the current structure in 1920, when the Russell Street shops were constructed, although the arched doorway to the ground floor may remain from the earlier structure.

The early tenants of 138-140 Russell Street included Mrs Benjamin Mitchell, clothier and wardrobe dealer (S&Mc 1915-1925); Croft’s Stores, grocers (S&Mc 1930); and Conn’s Corner Tea House (S&Mc 1942). The shops are currently occupied by two food and drink outlets (CoMMaps).

In March 1937, the property underwent building works including the alterations and ‘erection of shop front’, with the cost totalling £1022 (MBAI). It is likely that the street façades were refaced at the same time. Some of the late Victorian design elements, including the arched entrance, decorative cornices and eave brackets, survive in the section at 142 Russell Street (Figure 4) (Commercial Photographic Co c1940s, SLV).

Today, the building contains one residential property and two food and drink outlets (CoMMaps).

Figure 3. A 1950s aerial view of 173-175 Bourke Street. (Source: Pratt c1950s, SLV)
Albert Purchas, architect

Albert Purchas (1825-1909), architect, civil engineer and surveyor, was born in Chepstowe, England. He arrived in Victoria in 1851 and soon established an architectural practice. In 1853 he was the author of a *Book of Reference and Map of the Settled Districts Around Melbourne*. Joining the Victorian Institute of Architects in 1856, his first major works involved the Oriental Bank (1856) and the Melbourne General Cemetery (1853) (Tibbits & Goad 2012:570).

In 1856, Purchas was joined by his brother-in-law Charles R Swyer (1825-76). Together they designed many banks, mostly in the Renaissance Revival style, and ecclesiastical buildings, mostly in the early Gothic Revival style. The partnership Purchas & Swyer practised until 1862. After the partnership separated, Swyer went to New Zealand and Purchas continued his sole practice until his death, although it appears he was less active after 1891. Purchas's most well-known works include St George's Presbyterian Church, a polychromatic Gothic Revival church in St Kilda; the offices of the Mutual Insurance Company and the Northern Insurance Company, Collins Street West; and warehouses for Briscoe & Co and George & George both in Collins Street (Tibbits & Goad 2012:570).

Purchas was also a Justice of the Peace, and for many years vice-president of the Victorian Institute of Architects (VIA). In 1887-88 he served a term as VIA president, and between 1873 and 1886 he was the secretary of the Melbourne General Cemetery and the chairman of the Cemetery Board from 1867 to 1909 (Tibbits & Goad 2012:570).

Godfrey & Spowers, architects

William Scott Purves Godfrey (1872-1953) was born in Toorak, Victoria. He was articled by Reed, Henderson & Smart in 1889, and started his own practice in Collins Street in Melbourne in 1895. On his return from two years in the United Kingdom and Europe, Godfrey entered partnership with Henry Howard Spowers (c1873-1933) (Murphy & Raworth 2012:278-9).

In the following decades, Godfrey & Spowers completed a large number of houses, warehouses and institutional buildings, along with bank buildings, for which the firm became renowned. In 1936 the partnership was awarded the Street Architecture Medal for the Bank of NSW, at 374 Collins Street, Melbourne (Murphy & Raworth 2012:278-9).
Spowers died in 1932, and Godfrey’s son, William Purves Race Godfrey (1907-83) joined the firm in the early 1930s whilst studying. Graduating from the University of Melbourne with a Bachelor of Architecture in 1933, Race Godfrey was admitted as an associate to the Royal Victorian Institute of Architects (RVIA) in 1934 and was the president of RVIA in 1956-7 (Murphy & Raworth 2012:278-9).

The firm continues to practice today, having changed its name from Godfrey Spowers, Hughes Mewton & Lobb in the 1960s to Spowers in the 1990s. Notable works by the firm include the Argus Building (1926) and the Egyptian-influenced Bank of New South Wales at 190 Bourke Street (1930) (Murphy & Raworth 2012:278-9).

SITE DESCRIPTION

173-175 Bourke Street comprises a three-storey corner building dating from 1857, a three-storey addition built between 1880s-1895 facing Russell Street (142 Russell Street), and a pair of two-storey brick shops rebuilt in the 1920s, also facing Russell Street (138-140 Russell Street). The complex of buildings, though built at separate times, appears as a somewhat cohesive grouping located on the corner site, with consistent banding lines continuing across the façade of each section of the building as a result of the 1937 alterations.

The corner building is constructed of brick with a rendered finish and built to both street boundaries with a parapet wall concealing a hipped roof. Early images show an elaborately decorated façade designed by architect Albert Purchas, however few details remain following the refacing of the façade in the early twentieth century. Window openings remain intact with three regular rectangular openings on each of the upper levels of the Bourke Street elevation. On Russell Street a tripartite composition is located centrally on the elevation, with a single rectangular opening at either end. The ground floor has also been altered significantly. A modern cantilevered verandah has replaced the early post-supported verandah.

The narrow three-storey building at 142 Russell Street retains an arched opening at the ground level that appears to date from the late Victorian era. A timber door to the arch also appears to be an early feature and a fanlight window remains but has been overpainted with modern signage. The pair of two-storey shops at 138-140 Russell Street, rebuilt in the interwar period by Godfrey & Spowers have centrally-arranged engaged pilasters, rendered name plates along the top of the building and at the ground floor, and three regular window openings at the upper level of each shop. Alterations have occurred at ground level.

INTEGRITY

The building at 173-175 Bourke Street incorporating 138-140 Russell Street and 142 Russell Street was built in three sections. The Victorian shop at 173-175 Bourke Street has been twice substantially altered. No.142 Russell Street retains a ground floor arched opening that appears to date from the construction that linked the other two buildings, but has been extended by two floors. Alterations have occurred at ground level of all three sections of the building and the cantilevered verandah is of contemporary construction. The buildings as they present today are consistent with the extent of the 1937 alterations.
COMPARATIVE ANALYSIS

By the 1840s, Bourke Street was established as the preferred retail strip in the central city. During the latter half of the nineteenth century, multi-storey shop and dwelling type buildings housing ground-level shop with rooms above were constructed across the retail strips of Melbourne, and three-storeyed (or more) commercial and retail buildings were commonly built between Bourke and Lonsdale Streets from the late 1880s. The subject buildings represent aspects of the interwar period, although 173-175 Bourke Street is a particularly evolved design that has few clear precedents. Commercial premises that were either built or modified within the interwar period have been adopted for the purposes of comparison. The images and descriptions below are provided by CoMMMaps unless stated otherwise, with images dating from c2000 or later.

152-156 Swanston Street, 1888, remodelled in 1938 (Interim HO1295, Significant in Interim HO1289 Swanston Street South precinct)

The former Bank of Australasia at 152-156 Swanston Street was remodelled from two Victorian shops by A & K Henderson in 1938-39.

![Image of 152-156 Swanston Street, constructed 1888 and remodelled in 1938-39. (Source: Context 2017)](image)

David Jones, former Buckley & Nunn stores, 294-312 Bourke Street and 285-295 Little Bourke Street, 1933 (VHR H2153; HO980, Significant in HO509 Post Office Precinct)

In 1933 the former Buckley and Nunn store was extended to the east, with the building of a new men's store, designed by Walter Osbert McCutcheon. The original shopfronts have been replaced and cantilevered verandas added across the entire Bourke Street façade. David Jones is one of Australia’s oldest department store company, having opened their first store in Sydney in 1838.
Former Law Institute of Victoria, 382 Little Collins Street, 1905 & altered 1924 (Recommended as significant in the Hoddle Grid Heritage Review)

Located at the corner of Little Collins and McKillop streets, the former Law Institute of Victoria building at 382 Little Collins Street was originally built in 1905-06 to house the retail business of established hardware manufacturer, W Willis & Co. In c1924, the Law Institute of Victoria engaged architects Peck & Kemter to modify the building to suit their usage of the building’s upper storeys, remodelling the western elevation fronting McKillop Street to enlarge openings on the upper levels and to create additional retail spaces fronting McKillop Street.

Farrant’s Building, 387 Little Bourke Street, 1926 (Significant in HO1205 Guildford & Hardware Laneways Precinct)

Farrant’s building is more clearly of the interwar period, having been constructed in 1926 for saddle manufacturer Farrant’s, the three-storey building comprises retail and manufacturing premises. It has
two street frontages, facing Little Bourke Street and Hardware Lane. It is a good example of interwar classical revival design.

Like the examples above, 173-175 Bourke Street demonstrates the evolution of retailing in the interwar period. The building fronting Bourke Street and the accompanying photographic evidence clearly demonstrate the building’s adaptation from a Victorian retail premises to its current condition. The complex of buildings at 173-175 Bourke Street once owned by the Hordern family, is comparable historically with the establishment of Buckley & Nunn and with its interwar expansion. 173-175 Bourke Street is prominently sited and commands a presence at the corner of Russell Street, compared with more modest interwar commercial premises such as 387 Little Bourke Street and 382 Little Collins Street.
### ASSESSMENT AGAINST CRITERIA

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CRITERION</th>
<th>Description</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>✓ CRITERION A</td>
<td>Importance to the course or pattern of our cultural or natural history (historical significance).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CRITERION B</td>
<td>Possession of uncommon rare or endangered aspects of our cultural or natural history (rarity).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CRITERION C</td>
<td>Potential to yield information that will contribute to an understanding of our cultural or natural history (research potential).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>✓ CRITERION D</td>
<td>Importance in demonstrating the principal characteristics of a class of cultural or natural places or environments (representativeness).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CRITERION E</td>
<td>Importance of exhibiting particular aesthetic characteristics (aesthetic significance).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CRITERION F</td>
<td>Importance in demonstrating a high degree of creative or technical achievement at a particular period (technical significance).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CRITERION G</td>
<td>Strong or special association with a particular community or cultural group for social, cultural or spiritual reasons. This includes the significance of a place to Indigenous peoples as part of their continuing and developing cultural traditions (social significance).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>CRITERION H</td>
<td>Special association with the life or works of a person, or group of persons, of importance in our history (associative significance).</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
RECOMMENDATIONS

Recommended for inclusion in the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay of the Melbourne Planning Scheme as an Individual Heritage Place.

Recommendations for the Schedule to the Heritage Overlay (Clause 43.01) in the Melbourne Planning Scheme:

MELBOURNE PLANNING SCHEME

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Category</th>
<th>Control</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>EXTERNAL PAINT CONTROLS</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>INTERNAL ALTERATION CONTROLS</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TREE CONTROLS</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>OUTBUILDINGS OR FENCES (Which are not exempt under Clause 43.01-3)</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>TO BE INCLUDED ON THE VICTORIAN HERITAGE REGISTER</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>PROHIBITED USES MAY BE PERMITTED</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>ABORIGINAL HERITAGE PLACE</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

OTHER

N/A
REFERENCES

Age, as cited.

Argus, as cited.

Australian Architectural Index (AAI), as cited. Copyright Miles Lewis.

Australian Builders, as cited.


Context Pty Ltd 2012, Thematic History: A History of the City of Melbourne’s Urban Environment, prepared for the City of Melbourne.


Mahlstedt and Gee 1888, Standard plans of the city of Melbourne, Mahlstedt and Gee, Melbourne.

Mahlstedt, G 1910, Index to City of Melbourne detail fire survey, Mahlstedt, Melbourne.

Mahlstedt’s Pty Ltd 1925 City of Melbourne detail fire survey. Section 1, Mahlstedt Pty Ltd, Melbourne.

Mahlstedt’s Pty Ltd 1948 City of Melbourne detail fire survey. Section 1, Mahlstedt Pty Ltd, Melbourne.


## PREVIOUS STUDIES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Study</th>
<th>Grade</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Central Activities District Conservation Study 1985</td>
<td>D</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Central City Heritage Study 1993</td>
<td>C</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Review of Heritage overlay listings in the CBD 2002</td>
<td>Ungraded</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Central City Heritage Review 2011</td>
<td>Ungraded</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
STATEMENT OF SIGNIFICANCE

Heritage Place: Shops

PS ref no: Interim HO1238

What is significant?

The complex of buildings at 173-175 Bourke Street (142 Russell Street), Melbourne, comprising; a three-storey corner building dating from 1857, a three-storey addition either replacing or extending an existing building from 1920 (142 Russell Street), and a pair of adjoining shops rebuilt in brick in the 1920s, also facing Russell Street (138-142 Russell Street).

Elements that contribute to the significance of the place include (but are not limited to):

- The buildings’ cohesive external forms (two and three storeys), with consistent banding continuing across the façade of each section;
- The three-storey corner building’s high level of integrity to its 1937 design;
- The three-and-two-storey Russell Street buildings’ high level of integrity to its original design;
- Pattern and size of original or early fenestration (Bourke and Russell streets), including the early ground floor arched opening at 142 Russell Street; and
- Large square industrial steel-framed windows (Little Collins Street).

More recent alterations, including the modern cantilevered verandah and ground level shopfronts, are not significant.

How it is significant?

173-175 Bourke Street (142 Russell Street), Melbourne is of local historic and representative significance to the City of Melbourne.
Why it is significant?

173-175 Bourke Street is historically significant as a complex of retail buildings dating from 1857, with additions in the first decades of the twentieth century that reflect key phases in the expansion of retail development in the City of Melbourne. The building complex is historically significant for its association with the Hordern family, a well-known Australian retailing dynasty who first came to prominence as merchants and retailers in Sydney, and who owned both the corner site and the Russell Street frontages until 1872. 173-175 Bourke Street, is historically significant for its long occupation by Richard White’s Shoe Store from the mid-1890s to the 1970s. (Criterion A)

173-175 Bourke Street is significant as an early commercial building, but with its current presentation dating from the interwar period and incorporating both nineteenth and twentieth century elements. The corner building remains legible in scale and form to its 1857 design by architect Albert Purchas despite two major alterations to its elevations. The elements of the 1857 building are evident in the three rectangular openings on each of the upper levels on the Bourke Street façades, and the pattern of tripartite and single rectangular windows to the Russell Street façade. Evidence of the previous two separate buildings facing Russell Street is provided by the arched ground level opening with timber doors and fanlight. The substantial alterations and extensions by Godfrey & Spowers in 1920, incorporating 138-142 Russell Street, contribute to the interwar character of the Russell and Bourke Street corner. (Criterion D)

Primary source

Hoddle Grid Heritage Review (Context & GJM Heritage, 2020)